

Message

**From:** [REDACTED] [AG/5040] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=EA-5041-01/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=[REDACTED]]  
**Sent:** 1/8/2009 5:19:47 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED] [AG/5170] [REDACTED]@monsanto.com]  
**CC:** FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000] [REDACTED]@monsanto.com]  
**Subject:** RE: New Seralini paper - glyphosate

I just talked to Donna who is on this call, and passed her answer to [REDACTED] - Donna has just left the call and will work on the response immediately. [REDACTED] said she can wait until 19.30 = 12.30 StL time for her response.

-----Original Message-----

**From:** [REDACTED] [AG/5170]  
**Sent:** 08 January 2009 18:03  
**To:** [REDACTED] [AG/5040]  
**Subject:** RE: New Seralini paper - glyphosate

I am in until 6.30 pm. Just wanted to ask you how to accelerate the rebuttal from the US colleagues, as usual this is the hot topic in the media and at field/distribution levels ...  
On the scientific/regulatory side : I have got [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] (MinAg) awaiting our position.  
You can even call me tonight, I attend the new comers dinner.... Thanks - [REDACTED]

-----Original Message-----

**From:** [REDACTED] [AG/5040]  
**Sent:** Thursday, January 08, 2009 5:53 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED] [AG/5170]  
**Subject:** RE: New Seralini paper - glyphosate

Sorry still on the call and some time to go yet. May be talk tomorrow am or is that too late?

-----Original Message-----

**From:** [REDACTED] [AG/5170]  
**Sent:** 08 January 2009 17:23  
**To:** [REDACTED] [AG/5040]; FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]; [REDACTED] [AG/5040]  
**Subject:** RE: New Seralini paper - glyphosate

Just to let you know that the french Min of Ag has made a saisine of AFSSA (French food safety agency), I had [REDACTED] on the phone and he is asking our rebuttal on the subject. I am collecting the previous positions we did 2-3 years ago in my archives. This is bad news because it puts the pressure on us but at the same time if AFSSA produces a good rebuttal and put it online on its website, it could help a lot on the communication side !!

- [REDACTED]

-----Original Message-----

**From:** [REDACTED] [AG/5040]  
**Sent:** Thursday, January 08, 2009 3:10 PM  
**To:** FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]; [REDACTED] [AG/5040]; [REDACTED] [AG/5170]  
**Subject:** RE: New Seralini paper - glyphosate

Donna,  
Not yet. I owe [REDACTED] a response to his follow up to last June's meeting and intend to call him next week to discuss.  
Regards  
[REDACTED]

-----Original Message-----

**From:** FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]  
**Sent:** 07 January 2009 17:10  
**To:** [REDACTED] [AG/5040]; [REDACTED] [AG/5040]; [REDACTED] [AG/5170]  
**Subject:** RE: New Seralini paper - glyphosate

[REDACTED] ...did you send this to [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] for comment?

Also saw Bill this morning and told him I think we need to do some experiments like Steve and I did for the Walsh...maybe have that discussion with [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] as well???? Seralini is going to continue to do these studies and we have to get them back into perspective...

Are the findings real?  
Are the reproducible?  
And then the so what factor...if surfactants found in bath gels, shampoos, dish washing detergents do the same thing...as we see caffeine can do....so what? Ban them all?

We are in our meeting and it is going well...on the side I am reading the seralini paper...

██████████ why does your contact want a mouse study??

We will get something out tomorrow...

-----Original Message-----

From: ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5040]  
Sent: Wednesday, January 07, 2009 8:55 AM  
To: FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]; ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5040]; ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5170]  
Subject: RE: New Seralini paper - glyphosate

Donna,  
He has been very specific this time to get over another of our past objections about not knowing the formulation. Express = MON 77737 Bioforce = MON 52276 Grands Travaux = MON 35010 GT Plus = MON 78294

██████████  
What product could be 785 g/L tallow amine ? Do we still sell it?

Regards  
██████████

-----Original Message-----

From: FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]  
Sent: 07 January 2009 15:40  
To: ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5040]; ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5040]  
Subject: FW: New Seralini paper - glyphosate  
Importance: High

██████████  
Take a look at the new seralini paper...are these our formulations? What is the composition? What about the doses? And what do you think the POEA is that Belle provided seralini?

Donna

-----Original Message-----

From: CARR, KATHERINE H [AG/1000]  
Sent: Monday, January 05, 2009 11:43 AM  
To: FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]; SALTMIRAS, DAVID A [AG/1000]; ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5040]; ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5040]; LEVINE, STEVEN L [AG/1000]  
Subject: FW: New Seralini paper - glyphosate  
Importance: High

The article is available at the following links:

PDF with embedded links (designed for PC viewing):  
<\\finch\ggtt-folder\public\external articles - full text\benachour\_2009.pdf>

High-resolution PDF (designed for printing) (~6 MB):  
<\\finch\ggtt-folder\public\external articles - full text\benachour\_2009\_hires.pdf>

-----Original Message-----

From: ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5040]  
Sent: Monday, January 05, 2009 1:26 AM  
To: HAMMOND, BRUCE G [AG/1000]; KRONENBERG, JOEL M [AG/1000]; GLENN, KEVIN C [AG/1000]; FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]; HEYDENS, WILLIAM F [AG/1000]; HEDGECOCK, F ANDY [AG/1000]  
Cc: ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5170]; ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5040]; ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5040]; SACHS, ERIC S [AG/1000]; ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5040]; ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5040]; ██████████ ██████████ [AG/5432]  
Subject: New Seralini paper - glyphosate

Dear All,

In case you are not aware yet, we have a new Seralini paper that was published on December 23 ( <http://pubs.acs.org/doi/abs/10.1021/tx800218n> ). "Glyphosate Formulations Induce Apoptosis and Necrosis in Human Umbilical, Embryonic, and Placental Cells." Nora Benachour and Gilles-Eric Seralini . Chem. Res. Toxicol. 2008. As you know RU is under pressure in France particularly and the team needs talking points very quickly. We would need an issue alert and response to the paper. I am travelling this week and will not be able to follow up further. [REDACTED] is responsible for RU FTO in our region and would be the point of contact.

Many Thanks for your help.

Kind Regards and best wishes for the New Year.

[REDACTED]