

Roger McClellan

From:

João Lauro <jdecam@uol.com >

Sent:

Monday, September 18, 2017 1:53 PM

To:

roger.o.mcclellan@a

Subject:

Glyogisae Papers Published in CRT

Dear Dr. McClellan.

I am not aware of any contribution to the manuscripts by someone not listed as coauthor of the published papers. I understand that the section on animal tumors - in which I did participate - was drafted and finalized solely by the panel members. I believe that the declaration of interests that appeared at the end of the articles accurately reflects my participation. During the panel activities and writing of these papers I did not have contact with anyone from Monsanto regarding the contents of the manuscripts. The published papers convey my own independent expert opinion.

J.L.V. de Camargo, MD, PhD, FIATP Professor of Pathology Botucatu Medical School 18618-000 Botucatu SP Brazil idecam@uol.com.br decam@fmb.unesp.br

PS – A copy of this email was sent to the other coauthors.

From: Roger McClellan

Sent: Friday, September 15, 2017 6:36 PM

To: gary williams@nymc ; mjaardema@me ; colin@sircolinberry. acquaiohn@ Michele.Burns@childrens.harvard r; dha3@ brusick41@ idecam@uol. helmut.areim@lrz.tum. | Idkier@ ; root@genetoxconsulting ksolomon@uoquelph. T.M.Sorahan@bham.ac ashley.roberts@intertek

Cc: Charles Whalley ; Roger O. Mccclellan ; Mildred B. Morgan

Subject: Glyogisae Papers Published in CRT

Roger O. McClellan, DVM, MMS, DSc (Honorary) Diplomate-ABT and ABVT Fellow-ATS, SRA, AAAR, HPS, and AAAS Member-National Academy of Medicine Editor, Critical Reviews in Toxicology Advisor, Toxicology and Human Health Risk Analysis

Albuquerque, NM 87111-7168 Tel: 5 : Cell: Fax: E-mail: roger.o.mcclellan@

September 15, 2017

Dear Dr Roberts, authors and co-authors of Review Papers:

This e-mail is being sent to you in view of your role in the preparation of five papers that were published on line in a Special Supplemental Issue of Critical Reviews in Toxicology entitled, "An Independent Review of the Carcinogenic Potential of Glyphosate." Volume 46, 2016. The five papers and an Introductory Article prepared by me as Editor of Critical Reviews in Toxicology are available electronically at http://tandfonline.com/toc/itxe20/46/sup1.

It was known by me and Taylor and Francis, the publisher of CRT, from the earliest communications on the supplemental issue that the review of glyphosate and preparation of the papers was sponsored financially by the Monsanto Company, a producer of glyphosate. It was fully anticipated that the specific role of Monsanto would be related in the Declaration of Interest for each article, and that the authorship attributed to each article would reflect all contributions made. The need for a Declaration of Interest (DOI) is clearly spelled out in the Instructions for Authors at

http://tandfonline.com/action/authorSubmission?journalCode=itxc20&page=instructions#Disclosure_statement. Moreover, I gave explicit instructions on multiple occasions on the need for each article to have an accurate, comprehensive and transparent DOI.

On submission, you confirmed that the authorship attributions, any declarations of funding and any DOIs were accurate and complete in the journal's peer review system. On publication, you made warranties in the Author Publishing Agreements again confirming this, and that you had understood and complied with the journal's ethical policies. You will understand that compliance with the journal and Taylor & Francis' policies here, which are in line with COPE and ICMJE guidelines, is paramount for maintaining the integrity of our published research.

Recently, as part of legal proceedings in California both internal and external communications by Monsanto personnel have been made public. These communications have been reported upon in Bloomberg Businessweek and the New York Times as well as elsewhere. The documents released raise serious questions as to whether the warranties made for all articles in the supplement were accurate. Specifically, the documents suggest that employees of Monsanto were involved in the drafting of articles in the supplement without being acknowledged as authors, and that the relationship between some authors on the supplement and Monsanto was not fully described in the DOIs. Overall, the documents suggest that the warranties made and DOIs provided with these articles do not accurately reflect the extent of Monsanto's involvement in their preparation.

This issue is sufficiently serious that Taylor and Francis, as the Publisher, with my assistance as Editor, have initiated an investigation. To assist in this investigation, at this stage I ask you to comment on the questions raised. Specifically, I would be grateful for your explanation as to the extent of any contributions to the drafting of articles in the supplement from authors not currently listed as authors and the accuracy of all Declarations of Interest. I ask that you respond by September 22nd.

I am CCing Charles Whalley, Managing Editor at Taylor & Francis, in this e-mail. I hope to receive a response from you soon.

Regards.

<!--[if !vml]--><!--[endif]--> Roger O. McClellan Editor, CRT