Correction

To cite this article: (2018): Correction, Critical Reviews in Toxicology, DOI: 10.1080/10408444.2018.1522175

To link to this article: https://doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2018.1522175

Published online: 30 Nov 2018.

Submit your article to this journal

Article views: 316

View Crossmark data
Correction

Article title: A review of the carcinogenic potential of glyphosate by four independent expert panels and comparison to the IARC assessment.


Journal: Critical Reviews in Toxicology

Bibliometrics: Volume 46(S1), pages 3-20, Year 2016

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2016.1214677

When this article was originally published on 28th September 2016, the contributions, contractual status and potential competing interests of all authors and non-author contributors were not fully disclosed to Critical Reviews in Toxicology. Specifically, the Acknowledgements and Declaration of Interest were not complete. After further clarification from the authors, these sections are corrected to reflect the full contributions, contractual status and, potential competing interests of all authors and non-author contributors and read as follows:

Acknowledgements

The authors gratefully acknowledge the extensive comments received from nine independent reviewers selected by the Editor and who were anonymous to the authors. These comments were very helpful in revising the manuscript. Ashley Roberts would like to thank his colleague at Intertek, Barry Lynch, for assistance in the preparation of the manuscript and William Heydens of Monsanto for providing a regulatory history overview for use by the authors in the preparation of this overview paper and his review of a preliminary draft of the overview manuscript and the final manuscript. The authors welcome the opportunity to correct the omission of the contributions of Barry Lynch, Intertek, and William Heydens, Monsanto in the original Acknowledgments. These individuals were not considered for authorship because they did not participate in the deliberations of the Panel and did not contribute to the conclusions drawn by the Panel. The conclusions were independently formulated by each of four Panel Sub-Groups as detailed in the individual papers.

Declaration of Interest

This overview paper (paper) is part of a supplement, the preparation of which was coordinated by Intertek Scientific & Regulatory Consultancy (Intertek) under the leadership of Ashley Roberts. It was prepared subsequent to completion of the four manuscripts as an overview and presented the opinions and conclusions of four groups of the expert panel. The expert panels were organized and supported administratively by Intertek. Funding was provided to Intertek by Monsanto Company, which is a primary producer and marketer of glyphosate and related products. All the expert panelists other than John Acquavella and Larry D. Kier were compensated through a contract with Intertek. John Acquavella and Larry D. Kier were compensated through existing consulting contracts with Monsanto Company. The employment affiliations of the authors are as shown on the cover page. The authors participated in the review process and preparation of this overview paper as independent professionals and not as representatives of their employers. Monsanto also supported presentation of the Panel's findings and conclusions by Gary Williams and Tom Sorahan as a poster entitled "Expert Panel Review of the Carcinogenic Potential of the Herbicide Glyphosate" at the Society for Risk Analysis Annual Meeting in Arlington, VA, December 6-10, 2015, prior to the publication of the manuscripts. William Heydens of Monsanto reviewed a draft of this overview paper and suggested wording changes but did not comment on the opinions and conclusions of the expert panel. The opinions expressed, and final conclusions set out in this overview paper were those of the listed authors and no one else.

While Intertek (formerly Cantox) has not previously worked on glyphosate-related matters for the Monsanto Company, previous employees (Ian Munro and Douglass Bryant) of Cantox, have worked in this capacity. Ian Munro and Gary Williams, with the assistance of Douglass Bryant, prepared a safety and risk assessment of Roundup® herbicide (glyphosate), which was supported by Monsanto (Williams et al, 2000).
Gary Williams, Sir Colin Berry, David Brusick, Joao Lauro Viana de Camargo, Helmut A. Greim, David J. Kirkland, and Tom Sorahan have previously served as independent consultants for the Monsanto Company, some serving on the European Glyphosate Task Force. Keith R. Solomon previously served as an independent consultant for the Monsanto Company on the deregulation of RR alfalfa in the US (2012-2014). In collaboration with Cantox, Dr. Solomon contributed to an ecotoxicological risk assessment for Roundup® herbicide, which was published (Giesy et al., 2000). In addition, between 2014 and 2016, he served on a scientific advisory board to Dow AgroSciences, which markets pesticides, including glyphosate. John Acquavella and Larry D. Kier have also served as independent consultants and were previously employees of the Monsanto Company. John Acquavella was employed by Monsanto between the years 1989 and 2004. He is a consultant on a legal case unrelated to glyphosate that involved a former Monsanto industrial chemical plant. Larry Kier was employed as a consultant by Monsanto to provide support for the Glyphosate Expert Panel in the areas of genotoxicity and oxidative stress. Larry Kier did review the report as it was being written and provided his expertise when requested by the panel members. After the final draft of the report was written Larry was added as a co-author and genotoxicity Expert Panel member based on a unanimous decision of the original genotoxicity Expert Panel Members.

Helmut Greim has previously reviewed the available long-term studies in rodents and has published a paper (Greim et al., 2015) together with three coauthors. One of them, an employee of Monsanto, provided the original data from the studies conducted by Monsanto, the other two authors were independent consultants, one of them a member of the glyphosate task force.

David Garabrant served in 2014-16 on a scientific advisory board to Dow AgroSciences, which markets pesticides including glyphosate. He was jointly retained by Bayer Corporation; Bayer CropScience LP; Bayer CropScience Holding, Inc.; Dow AgroSciences, L.L.C.; BASF Corporation; Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc., Deere & Company, Lesco, Inc.; and Monsanto in litigation matters concerning glyphosate and leukemia. He also provided consultation in February 2016 to an attorney representing Pharmacia (formerly Monsanto) in litigation that did not involve glyphosate. Tom Sorahan has consulted for Monsanto on litigation matters involving glyphosate. Tom Sorahan has received consultancy fees and travel grants from Monsanto Europe SA/NV as a member of the European Glyphosate Toxicology Advisory Panel and participated in the IARC Monograph Meeting for volume 112, as an Observer for the Monsanto Company. Douglas L. Weed has consulted on litigation matters for Monsanto that did not involve glyphosate.

Other than David Garabrant and Tom Sorahan, none of the authors had previously been involved in any litigation procedures involving Monsanto and glyphosate.

Marilyn Aardema, Michele M. Burns, Gary Marsh and Ashley Roberts had not been previously involved in any activity involving glyphosate and as such declare no potential conflicts of interest.

The authors apologize for any errors or omissions in the original disclosure.
Corrigendum

To cite this article: (2018): Corrigendum, Critical Reviews in Toxicology, DOI: 10.1080/10408444.2018.1522142

To link to this article: https://doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2018.1522142

Published online: 26 Sep 2018.

Submit your article to this journal

Article views: 601

View Crossmark data
Corrigendum


http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2016.1214681

When this article was originally published on 28th September 2016, the contributions, contractual status and potential competing interests of all authors and non-author contributors were not fully disclosed. Specifically, the Acknowledgements and Declaration of Interest were not complete. These sections should read as follows:

Acknowledgements

The authors gratefully acknowledge the very useful comments provided by seven reviewers who were selected by the Editor and anonymous to the authors. These comments helped improve the manuscript. William Heydens of Monsanto reviewed the initial draft of our manuscript and commented that the section on analytic selection bias was unclear to him and that we might define the term “grey literature.” He also pointed out some typographical errors. Based on his feedback, the authors decided to clarify the section on analytic selection bias, define grey literature in a footnote, and correct the typos. All additions, deletions, and changes to the draft manuscript were made only by the authors, with unanimous agreement.

Declaration of Interest

The employment affiliation of the authors is as shown on the cover page. However, it should be recognized that each individual participated in the review process and preparation of this paper as an independent professional and not as a representative of their employer. This expert panel evaluation was organized and conducted by Intertek Scientific & Regulatory Consultancy. Funding for this evaluation was provided by Monsanto Company, which is a primary producer of glyphosate and products containing this active ingredient. The authors had sole responsibility for the content of the paper, and the interpretations and opinions expressed in the paper are those of the authors.

JA worked for Monsanto from 1989 through 2004. He is currently a consultant on a legal case unrelated to glyphosate that involves a former Monsanto industrial chemical plant. DG serves on a scientific advisory board to Dow Agro Sciences, which markets pesticides including glyphosate. He was jointly retained by Bayer Corporation; Bayer CropScience LP; Bayer CropScience Holding, Inc.; Dow AgroSciences, LLC.; BASF Corporation; Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc., Deere & Company, Lesco, Inc.; and Monsanto in litigation matters concerning glyphosate and leukemia. He also provided consultation in February 2016 to an attorney representing Pharmacia (formerly Monsanto) in litigation that did not involve glyphosate. That consultation consisted of 0.3 hours of professional services, after which he did no further work on the litigation. GM has no additional declarations. TS has received consultancy fees and travel grants from Monsanto Europe SA/NV as a member of the European Glyphosate Toxicology Advisory Panel and participated in the IARC Monograph Meeting for volume 112 which reviewed the literature and provided a carcinogenic hazard assessment for glyphosate as an Observer for the Monsanto Company. In addition, TS has consulted for Monsanto on litigation matters involving glyphosate. DW has consulted on litigation matters concerning Monsanto that did not involve glyphosate. This article is part of a supplement, sponsored and supported by Intertek Scientific & Regulatory Consultancy. Funding for the sponsorship of this supplement was provided to Intertek by the Monsanto Company, which is a primary producer of glyphosate and products containing this active ingredient. JA was paid directly by Monsanto for his work on this expert panel through an existing consultant contract. The other authors (DG, GM, TS, DW) were paid by Intertek, which was funded by Monsanto.

This article is part of a supplement, sponsored and supported by Intertek Scientific & Regulatory Consultancy. Funding for the sponsorship of this supplement was provided to Intertek by the Monsanto Company, which is a primary producer of glyphosate and products containing this active ingredient.

The authors apologize for these errors.
Corrigendum

To cite this article: (2018): Corrigendum. Critical Reviews in Toxicology, DOI: 10.1080/10408444.2018.1522133

To link to this article: https://doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2018.1522133

Published online: 26 Sep 2018.

Submit your article to this journal

Article views: 643

View Crossmark data
Corrigendum


http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2016.1214680

When this article was originally published on 28th September 2016, the contributions, contractual status and potential competing interests of all authors and non-author contributors were not fully disclosed. Specifically, the Acknowledgements and Declaration of Interest were not complete. These sections should read as follows:

Acknowledgements

The authors gratefully acknowledge the extensive comments received from seven independent reviewers selected by the Editor and who were anonymous to the authors. These comments were very helpful in revising the original submitted manuscript. The authors also gratefully acknowledge the clerical assistance of Anna Bickel, a Monsanto employee, in formatting the final paper prior to submission to the journal.

Declaration of interest

The employment affiliation of the authors is as shown on the cover page. Each individual participated in the review process and preparation of this paper as an independent professional. No individuals other than the cited authors were involved in developing the analysis and conclusions of the manuscript prior to its submission to the journal.

The Expert Panel Member recruitment was organized and conducted by Intertek Scientific & Regulatory Consultancy (Intertek) and the initial Expert Panelists worked under individual consulting contracts with Intertek. Intertek (previously Cantox) is a consultancy firm that provides scientific and regulatory advice, as well as safety and efficacy evaluations for the chemical, food, and pharmaceutical industries. While Intertek Scientific & Regulatory Consultancy has not previously worked on glyphosate related matters for the Monsanto Company, previous employees of Cantox had worked in this capacity.

Larry Kier did not have a consulting contract with Intertek; he was employed as a consultant by Monsanto to provide support for the Glyphosate Expert Panel in the areas of genotoxicity and oxidative stress. LK did review the report as it was being written and provided his expertise when requested by the panel members. After the final draft of the report was written Larry was added as a co-author and genotoxicity Expert Panel member based on a unanimous decision of the original genotoxicity Expert Panel Members.

Gary Williams, David Brusick, and David Kirkland have previously served as independent consultants for the Monsanto Company, some serving on the European Glyphosate Task Force. Larry Kier was previously an employee of the Monsanto Company (1974-2000) and has also served as an independent consultant for Monsanto Company. As consultants to the Glyphosate Task Force LK and DK prepared and published a review of the genotoxicity of glyphosate and glyphosate-based formulations (Kier and Kirkland, 2013) and as a consultant to Monsanto LK prepared and published a review of genotoxicity biomonitoring studies of glyphosate-based formulations (Kier, 2015). Marilyn Aardema has not previously been employed in the Monsanto Company or previously been involved in any activity involving glyphosate as such declares no potential conflicts of interest. Ian Munro, Douglass W. Bryant, and Gary Williams prepared a safety and risk assessment paper of Roundup herbicide (glyphosate) (Williams G.M. et al., 2000).

Except for assistance with final formatting, neither any Monsanto company employees nor any attorney provided any review of the Expert Panel’s manuscript analysis and conclusions prior to submission to the journal.

This article is part of a supplement, sponsored and supported by Intertek Scientific & Regulatory Consultancy. Funding for the sponsorship of this supplement was provided to Intertek by the Monsanto Company, which is a primary producer of glyphosate and products containing this active ingredient.

The authors apologize for these errors.
Corrigendum

To cite this article: (2018): Corrigendum, Critical Reviews in Toxicology, DOI: 10.1080/10408444.2018.1522751

To link to this article: https://doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2018.1522751

Published online: 26 Sep 2018.
Corrigendum


http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2016.1214678

When this article was originally published on 28th September 2016, the contributions, contractual status and potential competing interests of all authors and non-author contributors were not fully disclosed. Specifically, the Declaration of Interest were not complete. These sections should read as follows:

Acknowledgment

The author gratefully acknowledges the extensive comments offered by five reviewers selected by the Editor and presented anonymously to the author. These comments were useful in revising the paper. I thank Monsanto Inc. for providing access to reports from exposure studies for glyphosate in applicators and Dr. Marian Bleeke (of Monsanto Inc.) for clarification of some of the methods used. I wish to thank the authors of the other papers in this series for their constructive suggestions and comments.

Declaration of interest

The employment affiliation of the author is shown on the cover page. However, it should be recognized that the author participated in the review process and preparation of this paper as an independent professional and not as a representative of his employer. Keith R. Solomon previously served as an independent consultant for the Monsanto Company on the deregulation of RR alfalfa in the US (2012-2014). In collaboration with Cantox, the predecessor company to Intertek Scientific and Regulatory Consultancy (Intertek) KRS contributed to an ecotoxicological risk assessment for Roundup® herbicide, which was published (Giesy et al., 2000). In addition, between 2014 and 2016, he served on a scientific advisory board to Dow AgroSciences, which markets pesticides including glyphosate. KRS has not been involved in any litigation procedures involving Monsanto Company and glyphosate. KRS's recruitment and evaluation of the data was organized and conducted by Intertek. acted as a consultant for Intertek. Intertek is a consultancy firm that provides scientific and regulatory advice, as well as safety and efficacy evaluations for the chemical, food and pharmaceutical industries. Intertek prepared the paper for submission to the journal, made some formatting and editorial changes prior to submission, and, after review provided the comments from the reviewers to KRS. KRS was not provided with comments from William Heydens of Monsanto Inc., either directly or via Intertek.

While Intertek Scientific & Regulatory Consultancy (Intertek) has not previously worked on glyphosate related matters for the Monsanto Company, previous employees of Cantox, the predecessor company to Intertek, had worked in this capacity. Funding for this evaluation was provided to Intertek by the Monsanto Company which is a primary producer of glyphosate and products containing this active ingredient.

This article is part of a supplement, sponsored and supported by Intertek Scientific & Regulatory Consultancy. Funding for the sponsorship of this supplement was provided to Intertek by the Monsanto Company, which is a primary producer of glyphosate and products containing this active ingredient.

The author apologizes for these errors.
Corrigendum

To cite this article: (2018): Corrigendum, Critical Reviews in Toxicology, DOI: 10.1080/10408444.2018.1522784

To link to this article: https://doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2018.1522784

Published online: 30 Nov 2018.

Submit your article to this journal

Article views: 209

View Crossmark data
Corrigendum


http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2016.1214679

When this article was originally published on 28th September 2016, the contributions, contractual status and potential competing interests of all authors and non-author contributors were not fully disclosed. Specifically, the Acknowledgements and Declaration of Interest were not complete. These sections should read as follows:

Acknowledgements

The authors gratefully acknowledge the extensive comments received from nine independent reviewers selected by the Editor and who were anonymous to the authors. These comments were very helpful in revising the manuscript. Materials for consideration for use in the preparation of this paper were provided by Intertek. The authors thank Barry Lynch of Intertek for writing the Introduction to the paper. Dr. Williams thanks his colleague, Dr. Michael J. Iatropoulos for assistance in writing the section on mouse kidney tumors, and Ms. Sharon Brana for typing the manuscript.

Declaration of Interest

This paper is part of a series on glyphosate, which was sponsored and supported by Intertek Scientific & Regulatory Consultancy (Intertek) under the leadership of Ashley Roberts. Funding for preparation of this supplement was provided to Intertek by the Monsanto Company, which is a primary producer of glyphosate and products containing this active ingredient.

The employment affiliations of the authors of the carcinogenicity group of the expert panel are as shown on the cover page. Each individual participated in the review process and preparation of this paper as an independent professional and not as a representative of their employer.

The carcinogenicity group members recruitment and the evaluation of the data was organized and conducted by Intertek Scientific & Regulatory Consultancy (Intertek). The group panelists were engaged by Intertek, and acted as consultants to Intertek and were not directly contacted by the Monsanto Company. Intertek (previously Cantox) is a consultancy firm that provides scientific and regulatory advice, as well as safety and efficacy evaluations for the chemical, food, and pharmaceutical industries. While Intertek has not previously worked on glyphosate-related matters for the Monsanto Company, previous employees (Ian Munro, Douglass W. Bryant, Barry Lynch) of Cantox, have worked in this capacity. Gary Williams coauthored a review of Roundup herbicide (glyphosate) (Williams et al, 2000), which was supported by Monsanto. Gary Williams, Sir Colin Berry, João Viana de Camargo, and Helmut Greim have previously served as independent consultants for the Monsanto Company, some on the European Glyphosate Task Force. Helmut Greim has previously reviewed the available long-term studies in rodents and has published a paper (Greim et al, 2015) together with three coauthors. One of them, an employee of Monsanto, provided the original data of the Monsanto studies, the other two were independent consultants, one of them a member of the glyphosate task force. Michele Burns has not previously been involved in any activity involving glyphosate and as such declares no potential conflict of interest. None of the aforementioned authors have been involved in any litigation procedures concerning glyphosate.

Neither any Monsanto company employees nor any attorney provided any review of the Expert Panel’s manuscript analysis and conclusions prior to submission to the journal.

The authors apologize for these errors.
Expression of Concern

To cite this article: (2018): Expression of Concern, Critical Reviews in Toxicology, DOI: 10.1080/10408444.2018.1522786

To link to this article: https://doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2018.1522786

Published online: 26 Sep 2018.

Submit your article to this journal

Article views: 1994

View Crossmark data
Expression of Concern

Critical Reviews in Toxicology, 46(S1): ‘An Independent Review of the Carcinogenic Potential of Glyphosate’

We, the Editor-in-Chief and Publisher of the journal, have been informed of concerns over the completeness of acknowledged contributions to the above supplement, and in the declarations of interest provided by the named contributors, for the following articles:


We have requested corrigenda from the authors to provide additional disclosure as to contributions to the articles. To date, we have only received corrigenda for three of the five articles that have been agreed by all authors. We have not received an adequate explanation as to why the necessary level of transparency was not met on first submission. We thank those who brought this matter to our attention. When reading the articles, we recommend that readers take this context into account. We will continue to work to update these articles and ensure full disclosure of all contributions to them.
Expression of Concern

To cite this article: (2018): Expression of Concern, Critical Reviews in Toxicology, DOI: 10.1080/10408444.2018.1539570

To link to this article: https://doi.org/10.1080/10408444.2018.1539570

Published online: 30 Nov 2018.

Submit your article to this journal

Article views: 97

View Crossmark data
Expression of Concern

Critical Reviews in Toxicology, 46(S1): 'An Independent Review of the Carcinogenic Potential of Glyphosate'

With the cooperation of the authors, we, the Editor-in-Chief and Publisher of the journal, have published corrigenda for each of the following articles:


After investigation into the completeness of the original declarations of interest provided by the authors, it was found that these did not fully represent the involvement of Monsanto or its employees or contractors in the authorship of the articles.

These corrigenda provide additional disclosure as to contributions to the articles, in some places in contradiction to the statements originally supplied.

We have not received an adequate explanation as to why the necessary level of transparency was not met on first submission and welcome the opportunity to address this. We regret that these corrections were necessary and thank those who brought this matter to our attention.

To the best of our knowledge, the scholarly record is now accurate; however, we recommend that readers take the additional context the corrected disclosures provide into account when reading the articles.