

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IN RE: ROUNDUP PRODUCTS  
LIABILITY LITIGATION

MDL No. 2741

Case No. 16-md-02741-VC

This document relates to:

*Hardeman v. Monsanto*, 3:16-cv-00525-VC

**PRETRIAL ORDER NO. 111:  
ORDER REQUESTING FURTHER  
INFORMATION ON DRS. BENBROOK  
AND WELCH**

It appears from the briefs and Dr. Benbrook's expert report that the plaintiffs propose to use Dr. Benbrook to present opinions on virtually every aspect of their case during Phase 2. To the extent that is what they intend, his testimony is excluded. If the plaintiffs wish to have Dr. Benbrook present a narrower opinion or opinions, they should file a 5-page brief by 10:00 a.m. on Thursday, March 14, 2019, articulating with much greater precision the specific opinions they propose for Dr. Benbrook to offer, including page citations to the sections in his report where those opinions were disclosed.

In addition, by 10:00 a.m. on March 14, 2019, Monsanto should file both Dr. Connie Welch's report and a letter explaining whether it intends to call Dr. Welch as a witness in the event that Dr. Benbrook does not testify.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Date: March 13, 2019



Honorable Vince Chhabria  
United States District Court