Case: 19-70115, 08/13/2019, ID: 11396549, DktEntry: 36-3, Page 186 of 246

Message

From: Scott, David E [scottde@purdue.edu]

Sent: 8/2/2018 2:09:45 PM

To: Steve Smith [ssmith@REDGOLD.com]; Keigwin, Richard [Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov]

CC: Waltz, Robert D [rwaltz@purdue.edu]; Ronald Hellenthal, Ph.D. [ronald.a.hellenthal.1@nd.edu]; Johnson, William G.

[wgj@purdue.edu]

Subject: RE: Reflections on the dicamba situation

Steve,

Thanks for your comments and observations. We will certainly add dicamba use restrictions, both federally and state, to the 9-28-18 IPRB meeting agenda. Although all of our 2018 dicamba investigations will not be formally finalized by then, I am hopeful that we may have a good feel for how best to proceed before the 2019 season.

Dave Scott
Pesticide Administrator
Office of Indiana State Chemist
scottde@purdue.edu

Personal Matters / Ex. 6

From: Steve Smith [mailto:ssmith@REDGOLD.com]

Sent: Thursday, August 02, 2018 9:55 AM

To: keigwin.richard@epa.gov; Scott, David E <scottde@purdue.edu>

Subject: Reflections on the dicamba situation

Richard and David,

As the two "official" people I've dealt with for a long time about the dicamba situation, I felt compelled today to write and express what I'm seeing out in the real world. I've seen the damage on beans, yields will be affected in some areas, but I also know those damages are affecting our soybean seed producers in the area as it is very likely many of those will be ineligible to be used for seed beans. Beck's Hybrids, a major seed producer for the Midwest, has become quite concerned over their seed crop for next year as I know personally of several seed fields that have been hit and germinations will be compromised. There is no measurement for that in any of your data you receive concerning damages.

But the main reason I am writing today is the realization of what I saw last night our driving through the countryside. For the last few weeks I've been driving down roads and looking at tree injury from "eye level" and certainly it was out there and a real shame. But what I saw last night shocked me. I began to look higher and the picture of what is happening has become clear. While there certainly has been direct drift damage, I am seeing damage high in trees that I hadn't noticed before which would be more of an indication of vapor type movement that doesn't show up quickly on trees but is making itself known extensively now. If you're not looking up, you won't see this phenomenon. Many species are really taking it hard, but I'm seeing oak trees and particularly silver maples really indicating severe injury. This is something I hadn't noticed before but I believe strongly indicates that even though we might have gotten by with not injuring something immediately next door, this stuff has picked up into the atmosphere and is hitting trees like I've never seen. It is sad indeed. No reports will reflect this, few reports will be made to agencies to investigate but it is a real situation.

You all know I have worked this issue sincerely in terms of crop damage for years, what I saw yesterday made me cringe for what is happening in the countryside. This technology will critically harm our rural countryside far beyond crop injury, which is still near and dear to my heart. But this new realization is something I had to write and make known for

Case: 19-70115, 08/13/2019, ID: 11396549, DktEntry: 36-3, Page 187 of 246

you guys. This is not hyperbole, it is real and if we don't get it recognized we'll all pay the penalty with the public once they figure it out.

My own house, soybeans and trees, have taken a hit. I have oak trees and silver maple that simply may not survive. My fruit trees are drying up and shriveling in an environment of almost perfect weather in our area. I will take this up with the offending party and made an official report to the State Chemist, but if my house has been hit, how many others are suffering damage and just have no idea of what's going on.

I know decisions are due out soon. I implore you to "look up" as you are out in the countryside (areas where dicamba has been used), it will shock you. Dave, Indiana needs to do what Arkansas has done even though it hasn't completely prevented injury, it certainly has reduced it. If possible, I would like to make an official proposal at the next PPRB meeting about this. Richard, from an EPA standpoint, this is an issue that needs national attention. In-crop usage is just not working out. The general public will come to distrust agriculture even more than they do now if this continues.

Here's a quote from Ford Baldwin, weed scientist from Arkansas that I think is appropriate.

"We can grow soybeans without dicamba, but you can't grow your crops with it being used". This is insightful indeed and something I hope you consider.

Thanks for allowing me to share my experiences and appreciate your consideration.

Steve Smith

Steve Smith | Director of Agriculture | Red Gold

1500 Tomato Country Way | P.O. Box 83 | Elwood, IN 46036

Tel 765.557.5500 x1419 | Personal Matters / Ex. 6 | Fax 765.557.3624

ssmith@redgold.com | www.RedGoldFoods.com



Grown By Families, Enjoyed By Families,"

Confidentiality Note: This e-mail, and any attachment to it, contains privileged and confidential information intended only for the use of the individual or entity named on the e-mail. If the reader of this e-mail is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that reading it is strictly prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please immediately return it to the sender and delete it from your system. Thank you.