1	Sandra A. Edwards (State Bar No. 154578) Joshua W. Malone (State Bar No. 301836)	
2	Farella Braun + Martel LLP	ELECTRONICALLY
3	235 Montgomery Street, 17th Floor San Francisco, CA 94104	FILED
4	Telephone: (415) 954-4400; Fax: (415) 954-448 sedwards@fbm.com	County of San Francisco
5	jmalone@fbm.com	06/18/2018 Clerk of the Court
3	Joe G. Hollingsworth (appearance pro hac vice)	BY:RONNIE OTERO Deputy Clerk
6	Martin C. Calhoun (appearance <i>pro hac vice</i>) Kirby T. Griffis (appearance <i>pro hac vice</i>)	
7	William J. Cople (appearance pro hac vice)	
8	Hollingsworth LLP 1350 I Street, N.W.	
9	Washington, DC 20005 Telephone: (202) 898-5800; Fax: (202) 682-163	9
10	jhollingsworth@hollingsworthllp.com/ mcalhoun@hollingsworthllp.com	
	kgriffis@hollingsworthllp.com	
11	wcople@hollingsworthllp.com	
12	George C. Lombardi (appearance <i>pro hac vice</i>) James M. Hilmert (appearance <i>pro hac vice</i>)	
13	Winston & Strawn LLP	
14	35 West Wacker Drive Chicago, IL 60601	
15	Telephone: (312) 558-5969; Fax: (312) 558-570 glombard@winston.com	0
16	jhilmert@winston.com	
	Attorneys for Defendant	
17	MONSANTO COMPANY	
18	SUPERIOR COURT OF TH	HE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
19		AN FRANCISCO
20	COUNTIONS	AN FRANCISCO
21		
22	DEWAYNE JOHNSON,	Case No. CGC-16-550128
23	Plaintiff,	DEFENDANT MONSANTO COMPANY'S REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL NOTICE OF
	vs.	U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION
24	MONSANTO COMPANY,	AGENCY DOCUMENTS AND FEDERAL REGISTER MATERIALS
25	Defendant.	Trial Date: June 18, 2018
26		Time: 9:30 a.m. Department: 504
27		Department. 304
28		

OVERVIEW:

A large part of Plaintiff Dewayne Johnson's ("Plaintiff") case is that a working group of the International Agency for Research on Cancer ("IARC") based in Lyon, France found, in March 2015, that glyphosate is a probable human carcinogen. The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") has repeatedly reviewed the scientific evidence on glyphosate, before and since the IARC classification, and concluded that it is *not* likely to be carcinogenic in humans. Those agency reviews are memorialized in official documents setting forth the conclusions and describing the processes used to reach them. Monsanto now asks the Court to take judicial notice of a number of those official documents, not for the truth of the matter asserted (e.g., that glyphosate does not cause cancer), but to demonstrate that EPA indeed conducted the reviews described in the official government documents and reached the conclusions the documents set forth.

TO EACH PARTY AND THEIR ATTORNEYS OF RECORD:

You ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED THAT, pursuant to California Evidence Code sections 451(b), 452(c), (g) and (h), and 453, Defendant Monsanto Company ("Monsanto") will and hereby does request that this Court take judicial notice of the following EPA official documents and materials from the Federal Register:

- 1. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 1** is a true and correct copy of EPA, Letter from Richard F. Mountfort, Section Head, Fungicide-Herbicides Branch on *Roundup EPA Reg. No.* 524-308 Your Application of May 15, 1974 & September 20, 1974 to Monsanto. (Oct. 18, 1974).
- 2. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 2** is a true and correct copy of EPA, Letter from Robert J. Taylor, Product Manager, Fungicide-Herbicide Branch on *Roundup EPA Reg. No. 524-308 Your Application of December 22, 1975* to Monsanto. (Dec. 23, 1975).
- 3. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 3** is a true and correct copy of EPA, *Reregistration Eligibility Decision (RED) Glyphosate*, Office of Prevention, Pesticides, and Toxic Substances (1993) https://www3.epa.gov/pesticides/chem_search/reg_actions/reregistration/red_PC-417300_1-Sep-93.pdf.

34812\6751322.1

¹ Unless otherwise stated, all citations herein are to the California Evidence Code.

28

ı		
1	EPA.gov (Dec. 12, 2017), https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2017-	
2	12/documents/revised_glyphosate_issue_paper_evaluation_of_carcinogenic_potential.pdf.	
3	15. Attached hereto as Exhibit 15 is a true and correct copy of Testimony of Anna B.	
4	Lowit, Science Advisor, OPP, EPA: Before the H. Comm. on Sci., Space, and Tech., 115 th Cong.	
5	(Feb. 6, 2018), http://docs.house.gov/meetings/SY/SY00/20180206/106828/HHRG-115-SY00-	
6	Wstate-LowitA-20180206.pdf.	
7	16. Attached hereto as Exhibit 16 is a true and correct copy of the March 10, 1992	
8	U.S. EPA Approval Letter with approved Monsanto glyphosate-based herbicide ("GBH") product	
9	labeling, https://www3.epa.gov/pesticides/chem_search/ppls/000524-00452-19920310.pdf .	
10	17. Attached hereto as Exhibit 17 is a true and correct copy of the Nov. 20, 2002 U.S.	
11	EPA Approval Letter with approved Monsanto GBH product labeling,	
12	https://www3.epa.gov/pesticides/chem_search/ppls/000524-00517-20021120.pdf.	
13	18. Attached hereto as Exhibit 18 is a true and correct copy of the March 8, 2006 U.S.	
14	EPA Approval Letter with approved Monsanto GBH product labeling,	
15	https://www3.epa.gov/pesticides/chem_search/ppls/000524-00529-20060308.pdf.	
16	19. Attached hereto as Exhibit 19 is a true and correct copy of the July 1, 2009 U.S.	
17	EPA Approval Letter with approved Monsanto GBH product labeling,	
18	https://www3.epa.gov/pesticides/chem_search/ppls/000524-00579-20090701.pdf.	
19	20. Attached hereto as Exhibit 20 is a true and correct copy of the Jan. 25, 2010 U.S.	
20	EPA Approval Letter with approved Monsanto GBH product labeling,	
21	https://www3.epa.gov/pesticides/chem_search/ppls/000524-00517-20100125.pdf.	
22	21. Attached hereto as Exhibit 21 is a true and correct copy of the March 10, 2016	
23	U.S. EPA Approval Letter with approved Monsanto GBH product labeling,	
24	https://www3.epa.gov/pesticides/chem_search/ppls/071995-00051-20160310.pdf.	
25	22. Attached hereto as Exhibit 22 is a true and correct copy of Glyphosate; Pesticide	
26	Tolerances, 62 Fed. Reg. 17,723 (Apr. 11, 1997) (to be codified in 40 C.F.R. pts. 180, 185, & 186)	
27	https://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/FR-1997-04-11/pdf/97-9231.pdf.	
28	23. Attached hereto as Exhibit 23 is a true and correct copy of Glyphosate; Pesticide	

1	Tolerances, 64 Fed. Reg. 66,108 (Nov. 24, 1999) (to be codified in 40 C.F.R. pt. 180)
2	https://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/FR-1999-11-24/pdf/FR-1999-11-24.pdf.
3	24. Attached hereto as Exhibit 24 is a true and correct copy of Glyphosate; Pesticide
4	Tolerances, 67 Fed. Reg. 60,934 (Sept. 27, 2002) (to be codified in 40 C.F.R. pt. 180)
5	https://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/FR-2002-09-27/pdf/02-24488.pdf.
6	25. Attached hereto as Exhibit 25 is a true and correct copy of Glyphosate; Pesticide
7	Tolerances, 69 Fed. Reg. 65,081 (Nov. 10, 2004) (to be codified in 40 C.F.R. pt. 180)
8	https://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/FR-2004-11-10/pdf/04-25098.pdf.
9	26. Attached hereto as Exhibit 26 is a true and correct copy of Glyphosate; Pesticide
10	Tolerances, 73 Fed. Reg. 73,586 (Dec. 3, 2008) (to be codified in 40 C.F.R. pt. 180)
11	https://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/FR-2008-12-03/pdf/E8-28571.pdf.
12	27. Attached hereto as Exhibit 27 is a true and correct copy of experts of Alkyl Amine
13	Polyalkoxylates; Exemption from the Requirement of a Tolerance, 74 Fed. Reg. 28,616 (June 17,
14	2009) ("Surfactant Cluster 4") https://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/FR-2009-06-17/pdf/E9-14113.pdf.
15	28. Attached hereto as Exhibit 28 is a true and correct copy of experts of Alkyl
16	Alcohol Alkoxylate Phosphate and Sulfate Derivatives; Exemption From the Requirement of a
17	Tolerance, 74 Fed. Reg. 37,571 (July 29, 2009) ("Surfactant Cluster 2")
18	https://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/FR-2009-07-29/pdf/E9-18033.pdf.
19	29. Attached hereto as Exhibit 29 is a true and correct copy of experts of Methyl
20	Poly(Oxyethylene)C8–C18 Alkylammonium Chlorides; Exemption from the Requirement of a
21	Tolerance, 74 Fed. Reg. 38,956 (Aug. 5, 2009) ("Surfactant Cluster 7")
22	https://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/FR-2009-08-05/pdf/E9-18348.pdf.
23	30. Attached hereto as Exhibit 30 is a true and correct copy of experts of Alkyl
24	Alcohol Alkoxylates; Exemption from the Requirement of a Tolerance, 74 Fed. Reg. 38,935 (Aug.
25	5, 2009) ("Surfactant Cluster 1") https://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/FR-2009-08-05/pdf/E9-
26	<u>18706.pdf.</u>
27	31. Attached hereto as Exhibit 31 is a true and correct copy of experts of Sodium and
28	Ammonium Naphthalenesulfonate Formaldehyde Condensates; Exemption from the Requirement
(a)	5 34812\6751322.1

8

11

12

15

16 17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27 28 626, 634 (1979) (affirming the trial court's decision to take judicial notice of, *inter alia*, excerpts of testimony given at legislative hearings under subdivision (c) of Evidence Code section 452).

Evidence Code section 452, subdivision (g) permits the Court to take judicial notice of "[f]acts and propositions that are of such common knowledge within the territorial jurisdiction of the court that they cannot reasonably be the subject of dispute." Cal. Evid. Code § 452(g). The fact need not be physically present within a court's jurisdiction, but rather, "common knowledge of the fact must exist within the court's territorial jurisdiction." Cal. Evid. Code § 452(g), Comment—Assembly Committee on Judiciary. Similarly, subdivision (h) allows judicial notice of "[f]acts and propositions that are not reasonably subject to dispute and are capable of immediate and accurate determination by resort to sources of reasonably indisputable accuracy." Cal. Evid. Code § 452(h). This includes facts that "are immediately ascertainable by reference to sources of reasonably indisputable accuracy." Cal. Evid. Code § 452(h), Comment-Assembly Committee on Judiciary.

In determining whether judicial notice is appropriate, the Court may rely on "any source of pertinent information" and "advice of persons learned in the subject matter." Cal. Evid. Code § 454. Evidence Code section 453 makes judicial notice of the matters specified in section 452 mandatory when, like here, sufficient notice is provided to adverse parties and when sufficient information is furnished to the Court. See Cal. Evid. Code § 453.

Monsanto requests that the Court take judicial notice of Exhibits 1-21, all of which constitute official acts of the EPA, under Evidence Code sections 452(c), (g), and (h). Exhibits 1-3 include EPA decision and guidance documents, officially approving labeling for Monsanto glyphosate-based herbicide ("GHB") products. Exhibits 4-14 include EPA's agency reports on glyphosate such as the Second Peer Review of Glyphosate (Exhibit 4), Report of the Hazard Identification Assessment Review Committee (Exhibit 5), Human Health Risk Assessments (Exhibits 6-11), and EPA Issue Papers (Exhibits 12-14). Exhibit 15 is Congressional testimony made by the EPA before the House Committee on Science, Space, and Technology.² Exhibits 16-

² The authenticity of Exhibit 15 is certified in the Affidavit and Sworn Report of Sylvia D. Hall-Ellis, Ph.D., at ¶ 63 (June 14, 2018).

21 include EPA product labeling approval letters. All Exhibits are available on the EPA websites (as shown by the website links cited above) or otherwise publicly available.

These agency records, reports, and orders are "official acts" of which a court should take judicial notice. *See* Cal. Evid. Code §§ 452(c), 453; *Rodas*, 87 Cal. App. 4th at 518; *Post*, 90 Cal. App. 3d at 634 (1979) (taking judicial notice of congressional testimony); *Gallagher v. Boller*, 231 Cal. App. 2d 482, 489 (1964) (taking judicial notice of agency "guide book"); *In re H.C.*, 17 Cal. App. 5th 1261, 1268 n.4 (2017) (taking judicial notice of a portion of the Child Welfare Policy Manual); *Stevens v. Super. Ct.*, 75 Cal. App. 4th 594, 608 (1999) (taking judicial notice of California Department of Insurance's letters). The documents are also proper for judicial notice because they contain facts and propositions of common knowledge within the territorial jurisdiction of the Court and so universally known that they cannot reasonably be the subject of dispute. Cal. Evid. Code §§ 452(g) and (h).

B. Exhibits 22-32 Are Judicially Noticeable as Federal Register Materials

Monsanto requests judicial notice of Exhibits 22-32, all of which are materials published in the Federal Register.

Under California Evidence Code section 451(b), the Court must take judicial notice of "[a]ny matter made a subject of judicial notice by . . . Section 1507 of Title 44 of the United States Code." Cal. Evid. Code § 451(b). That federal statute mandates that materials in the Federal Register be judicially noticed. 44 U.S.C. § 1507 ("The contents of the Federal Register shall be judicially noticed").

Accordingly, the Court must take judicial notice of these Federal Register materials. *See Black v. Fin. Freedom Senior Funding Corp.*, 92 Cal. App. 4th 917, 934 n.13 (2001) (granting in part party's request for judicial notice of Federal Register materials).

25 || /

27 II

Π. **CONCLUSION** For the foregoing reasons, Monsanto requests that the Court take judicial notice of Exhibits 1-32, including the EPA official documents and the materials from the Federal Register, for purposes of trial. Dated: June 18, 2018 Respectfully submitted, FARELLA BRAUN + MARTEL LLP an E Francisco By: Sandra A. Edwards Attorneys for Defendant MONSANTO COMPANY

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 18th day of June, 2018, I electronically filed the foregoing **DEFENDANT MONSANTO COMPANY'S REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL NOTICE OF U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY DOCUMENTS AND FEDERAL REGISTER MATERIALS (including Exhibits 1 through 32)** with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the following:

Curtis G. Hoke, Esq. The Miller Firm, LLC 108 Railroad Avenue Orange, VA 22960

Busan C. Hunt