

**Annual Meeting
Saturday, January 17, 2015
Chandler, Arizona**

DRAFT MINUTES

I. Call to Order

Dr. Samuel Cohen, Chair, ILSI Board of Trustees, called the meeting to order at 8:00 a.m. Mountain Standard Time. He welcomed the trustees, nominees for the Board, staff and guests. Dr. Cohen reviewed the operational rules for the ILSI Board of Trustees meeting. Observers were welcome but were asked to remain silent unless called upon by the chair. The ILSI Board may hold an executive session during which all non-trustees would be asked to leave. All motions, except motions attached to specific agenda items, must be submitted in writing at the time they are offered. Motion forms were included in each trustee's briefing book. Nominees for the ILSI Board of Trustees are welcome to participate in the Board discussions, but may not offer motions or vote. All trustees were asked to complete, sign and turn-in the Conflict of Interest form, which was included in the front pocket of the trustee briefing books.

The meeting agenda and list of participants and observers are attached.

II. Approval of Minutes from the July 14, 2014 ILSI Board of Trustees Conference Call

These draft minutes were distributed to the ILSI Board of Trustees electronically prior to the meeting and were included in the briefing book given to each trustee. Dr. Alan Boobis requested that the term "worthy" be removed from the last line of the "action" paragraph under Agenda Item VII, and be replaced with less value-laden language. With this change the minutes were unanimously approved.

III. President's Report

Dr. Jerry Hjelle, ILSI President, began his remarks by thanking the ILSI professional staff based in Washington as well as those based in the branches and Research Foundation for all of their support and efforts to implement the One ILSI strategy over the past two years. The One ILSI strategy was developed by the ILSI Board and professional staff during 2012-2013 and was formally launched at the beginning of his two-year term as ILSI President. Referring to the One ILSI Implementation Plan, which was included in the trustee briefing book, Dr. Hjelle described the components of the plan and its focus on foresight to increase ILSI's credibility and vision.

Four thematic areas were identified that together cover most of the scientific areas addressed by the organization. Dr. Hjelle specifically thanked the professional staff from the branches who had volunteered to lead these four thematic areas over the past two years. Professional development for key staff in the branches and the Research Foundation is a fundamental part of the implementation plan as well.

Dr. Hjelle said that he enjoyed visiting the various branches during his term as ILSI President. This experience allowed him to understand more clearly what a truly remarkable organization ILSI is. He

found his term as ILSI President to be personally gratifying and he thanked the trustees for their support.

IV. Progress with Implementation of the One ILSI Strategy

- a. ILSI Board Science Advisory Group** – Dr. Boobis reviewed the accomplishments of the Science Advisory Groups, whose members are himself and Dr. Peter van Bladeren, serving as Co-Chairs, Dr. Michael Doyle, Dr. Catherine Field, Dr. Lewis Smith, Dra. Sara Valdés, Dr. Connie Weaver and Dr. Flávio Zambrone. The group interacted with the leaders of the four thematic areas and oversaw the development of the key activities chart which is organized by the four thematic area topics. The advisory group also reviewed the Best Practice Guide for Identification of Emerging Issues and surveyed the branches to assess how they went about identifying emerging issues.

The survey results showed that a range of stakeholders were being consulted in the emerging issues identification process, though who is involved varies from branch to branch. The process of prioritization was even more variable with fewer branches involving external stakeholders. The survey results and the issues identified were included in the trustee briefing books. There is substantial overlap among the emerging issues identified by different branches, thus offering opportunities for collaboration.

Dr. Sushila Chang noted that branches operate in culturally different environments, making it unlikely that one specific process would work for all. The best practice approach which provides guidelines and concrete examples would be more helpful. Other trustees noted that some branches list activities rather than emerging issues. Dr. Lewis Smith commented that governance of the One ILSI strategy was needed to increase visibility. There was general agreement that the branches were communicating more effectively with each other, but cooperative and collaborative activities were still rare. More time during the annual meeting should be devoted to identifying areas of synergy and mechanisms to allow collaboration. Dr. Rhona Applebaum noted that doing so requires the branch staff to build the necessary skill set.

Dr. van Bladeren invited all interested trustees to participate in the Science Advisory Group's meeting with the thematic area leaders on Monday afternoon, January 19 at 5:30 pm. The advisory group relies on Board members to volunteer.

- b. ILSI Board Value/Stakeholder Group** – This advisory group is led by Dr. Todd Abraham, Dr. Cohen and Mr. Geoff Smith. Dr. Applebaum is also an active member of the group. The group worked with Mr. Michael Shirreffs, ILSI Director of Communications to draft a series of value statements for industry members and public advisors based on an online survey of trustees and academic advisors, interviews with key leaders and branch input.

Dr. Abraham noted that a series of materials (handed out at the meeting) were developed to reflect these value statements. Dr. Cohen commented that ILSI was being more proactive, less reactive in its messaging.

Mr. Shirreffs briefly reviewed the materials that were distributed. All are intended to be used as development materials and use a modular approach. There are three versions

of the fold-out document to demonstrate how it can be tailored to different audiences. One of the examples is in Korean, showing that languages other than English may be used. Such materials allow ILSI to centrally control the message, i.e., ensure that everyone speaks with one voice, as long as the translations are accurate. The set of program guides – linked to the four thematic areas – are still in draft so that the branches can comment on them. The objective of these documents is to present what ILSI is doing in a specific area, e.g., healthy aging, in an easy-to-read format. The final document is a case study on caffeine, which provides more detail on what ILSI accomplished with a body of work on a single topic. Additional case studies will be developed. Mr. Shirreffs is still developing the best practices guide for development that will go along with these communications tools.

Dr. Doyle suggested that more detail was needed in the program guide for food and water safety as the current text does not include all that ILSI is doing. Dr. Abraham acknowledged that the guides were still in draft and that he wanted to see the thematic area leaders take ownership of what goes in each guide.

In response to a question about how these materials will be used, Dr. Abraham said that this would be part of the advisory group's work for 2015. He acknowledged that it is hard to know all the ways the materials could be used at the local level and that some customization will be needed. This is why the modular approach was selected. Dr. Hjelle suggested that a master list of contacts made each year be compiled and metrics be developed to track the effectiveness of the materials for each of these contacts.

In 2015, the advisory group's priorities will be to validate the value statements, update the program guides based on branch feedback, identify specific topics for additional case studies highlighting ILSI science, prioritizing additional stakeholders for targeted outreach, and setting outreach goals with measures of success. Dr. Abraham ended his report by asking for volunteers.

- c. **Thematic area collaborations** – Dr. Suzie Harris briefly reviewed the outcome of the thematic area discussions during the ILSI Branch Staff Meeting on the previous day. All four groups experienced good cross-branch participation.

Food and Water Safety – This group is led by Dr. Eric Hentges, ILSI North America, and Mr. Keng Ngee Teoh, ILSI Southeast Asia Region. In 2015, the branches involved in this thematic area will continue to focus on capacity building on food safety risk assessment in Asia and Africa. Several ILSI branches are involved with the World Bank Global Food Safety Partnership (GSFP) and will undertake pilot testing of a new training module being developed by GSFP. This work links with the Toxicology/Risk Science thematic area as well. The two thematic areas are communicating with each other to leverage each's activity to the greatest extent possible. ILSI Europe volunteered to take on the leadership of the iFoodExposure project and proposed that interested branches join with them to support the expansion of the GUIDEA database of dietary intake/exposure methods beyond Europe. ILSI Japan Center for Health Promotion made a presentation to the group on Project SWAN, a community-based clean water activity.

Sustainable Agriculture and Nutrition Security – This group is led by Dra. Mariela Berezovsky, ILSI Brasil, and Dr. Morven McLean, ILSI Research Foundation. The group discussed further the plan to help the ILSI Research Foundation Center for Integrated Modeling of Sustainable Agriculture and Nutrition Security (CIMSANS) in identifying data in countries around the world that could be used to assess sustainable nutrition security for the very first time.

Nutrition, Health and Well-being – This group is led by Dr. Diána Bánáti, ILSI Europe, and Mrs. Yeong Boon Yee, ILSI Southeast Asia Region. The group discussed their ongoing effort to collect information on successful healthy aging interventions and to compile these into a public database for others to use in deciding how to support healthy aging. They are planning to organize a session during the 2015 SLAN (Latin American Nutrition Society) meeting and the 2017 International Union of Nutritional Scientists (IUNS) meeting. In addition to this work, the group agreed to explore two other important nutrition topics – nutrition for the first 1000 days of life and nutritional impact on the microbiome. This group also plans to update the matrix of branch activities for this thematic area.

Toxicology and Risk Science – This group is led by Ms. Cyril Pettit and Dr. Michelle Embry, ILSI Health and Environmental Sciences Institute (HESI). The Risk Science Forum, a branch staff group, is up and running with an online portal. The forum is designed as a way to enhance the understanding of state-of-the-art risk science by the branch staff. The branches involved in the thematic area are also contributing information about risk assessment training courses being offered in their regions. This information will be added to the WHO Risk Assessment Network database, which is managed by HESI. As a new activity the branches involved in this thematic area decided to try to identify groups for which such training is needed and to contribute to planning a workshop to identify best practices for such training.

Dr. Hjelle commented that there was a very high level of participation by the branches and, especially the thematic area leaders, during the discussions on the previous day. He urged trustees to volunteer as “champions” to help the thematic area groups identify potential funding sources. Shortening the period to raise funds will greatly impact the success of these programs.

- d. **One ILSI accountability** – Having annual performance evaluation goals linked to One ILSI for branch executive directors is part of the One ILSI Strategic Plan. Dr. Harris noted that this topic was addressed during the ILSI Branch Staff Meeting and all branches were encouraged to develop performance goals for the executive directors and for other staff, if feasible. At present not all branches use an annual performance evaluation system. The branch board should be responsible for ensuring that the branch executive director has a performance goal related to implementation of One ILSI.

Dr. Abraham asked that a common goal be developed, especially for the One ILSI thematic leaders, so that performance can be evaluated across the branch network.

V. **Communications**

Mr. Shirreffs began his report by acknowledging the help he receives from the Value/Stakeholder Advisory Group. He urged other trustees to volunteer to join this group, noting that he would like to have Latin America represented in the group. The primary components of the communications program are: developing messages, crafting strategies to deliver these messages, creating online and print materials, enhancing and maintaining the website, conducting outreach via social media, responding to the media, and improving search engine optimization (SEO) for ILSI. There are three communications tracks – traditional, internal or corporate, and development (the ask).

In 2014, a development kit was initiated. The process of developing the ILSI promotional materials pointed to the need to develop a case study on how to go about developing such materials, a project which he plans to take on this year. In addition, ILSI's social media program, which includes Facebook, Twitter, YouTube and LinkedIn, was enhanced. ILSI's presence on various social media platforms is steadily increasing. Videos of ILSI scientific programs posted on YouTube are popular, with over 69,000 viewing minutes recorded in 2014. In terms of ILSI's media presence, the organization is still not pursuing a proactive media program.

In 2015, Mr. Shirreffs will accelerate ILSI's social media program by adding more scientific content, exploring the feasibility of blogging and developing best practices. Dr. Applebaum endorsed blogging as a tool ILSI should use more. Mr. Shirreffs suggested that a guest editorial approach may be the way to begin. The focus of such blogs would be on science communication. In response to a question from Dr. Boobis about benchmarks for social media, Mr. Shirreffs said that he planned to track the return on investment of the social media tools to determine what is working and what is not. The communications budget includes funding for Mr. Shirreffs to attend several large scientific meetings in 2015, where he will tweet to enhance ILSI's presence on this platform. The Research Foundation and several branches have individuals who do the same for meetings they attend.

Mr. Shirreffs will focus on reenergizing ILSI EXTRA and refreshing the ILSI website, using information collected through surveys of users. ILSI has contracted with a professional web design group to oversee the refresh and a technology group to take care of the technical needs. The transition from the current site to the new one will be managed by him and Mr. Steve Parker, ILSI Information Technology Manager. The transition should be seamless over the course of 2015. The branch staff has been invited to participate in a meeting on Monday afternoon, January 19, with the professional design group to discuss what the branches need and want. The return on investment will be tracked for these communications tools, too. Further into the future, Mr. Shirreffs plans to work closely with ILSI's Information Technology department to determine the feasibility of a customer relations management database more suited to ILSI's communications needs than the current one.

Dr. Adam Drewnowski suggested that the re-fresh process should also include the needs of various international groups with whom ILSI works or wants to work. Mr. Shirreffs acknowledged this potential audience and noted that many were currently "following" ILSI through social media. Personal contact was suggested by Dr. Cohen as another way to reach the broader stakeholder audience.

Dr. John O'Brien complemented Mr. Shirreffs for developing such a clear path to enhancing ILSI's impact, but he also asked for more.

VI. Report from the Publications Committee

Dr. Connie Weaver, Chair of the Publications Committee, thanked the other members of the committee, Dr. Chang, Dr. Field, Dr. Michael Knowles, Dr. M.T. Kuwata, Mr. Felipe Rodriguez, Dra. Valdés, and Dr. Zambrone, for their help throughout the past year. The committee will meet on Monday, January 19, and other trustees are welcome to attend. Dr. Weaver also thanked Ms. Allison Worden, ILSI Publications Manager, for all of her work over the past year.

In 2014, the committee oversaw the search and selection process for a new publishing partner for *Nutrition Reviews*. One of the primary reasons was to improve financial returns from the journal. The committee also began exploring the potential benefits and risks of open data and open access initiatives with the goal of developing best practices guidelines. The committee also provided input toward the development of a new textbook, *Present Knowledge in Food Safety*.

Dr. Naomi Fukagawa is the current editor-in-chief of *Nutrition Reviews* and has been in this position since 2009. Beginning in January 2015, the journal will be published in partnership with Oxford University Press. The new publishing agreement included a signing bonus (\$100,000), increased royalty payments, and increased annual stipend for ILSI's costs associated with preparing manuscripts for publication. Dr. Weaver noted that *Nutrition Reviews* is the most highly cited monthly review journal in nutrition (Impact Factor = 5.541). ISI ranks *Nutrition Reviews* as fifth out of 78 journals in nutrition and dietetics. The journal is being translated into Japanese, Chinese, and Spanish by ILSI branches. Furthermore, as shown in Appendix A of the committee's report, *Nutrition Reviews* makes a profit for ILSI (\$87,386 projected in 2014). Dr. Abraham asked for information about how ILSI's revenue from *Nutrition Reviews* compares to that of other journals.

ILSI's other publication, *Present Knowledge in Nutrition (PKN), Tenth Edition*, was published in print and electronic formats in 2012. It is an essential reference text for researchers, health professionals, policy experts, educators and students. Dr. Weaver said that work on the eleventh edition is expected to begin in 2015. This work will include evaluating potential publishers, beginning a search and selection process for the new edition's editors, and conducting a market analysis to optimize the new edition for current research and teaching methods.

Dr. Knowles was given credit by Dr. Weaver for developing an exciting proposal for a new textbook, *Present Knowledge in Food Safety*. He serves as the lead editor for this proposed publication, which is intended to serve as a reference and teaching tool in the model of PKN. A publishing proposal will be sent to potential publishers in 2015.

Ms. Worden also led the initiative to find new metrics with which to measure the impact of ILSI scientific publications. She gave a well-received presentation on a new tool, Altmetric, during the ILSI Branch Staff meeting on Friday, January 16. Some of the Oxford University Press signing bonus will be used to subscribe to Altmetric and track the coverage of ILSI publications in social media, traditional media and government policy documents. These data will be used by each of ILSI's entities to set their own goals.

The committee recently began looking at issues related to open access and open data in an effort to understand the trends and potential implications for ILSI's publications. In line with most journals, *Nutrition Reviews* provides an opportunity for authors to purchase instant open access for their articles as well as gratis online space for sharing supplementary data sets related to their articles. To convert the journal to an entirely open access model in the current pricing environment would not be financially sustainable. Since the issues of open access and open data affect much of ILSI's work beyond

publications ILSI owns, the committee will draft best practice guidelines for open data and open access projects and share them with the ILSI Board for review.

Thus, the future work of the committee includes overseeing *Nutrition Reviews'* progress under its new publisher, overseeing development of *Present Knowledge in Food Safety* and the eleventh edition of PKN, monitoring evolving trends in scholarly publishing, proposing best practice guidelines for open data and open access endeavors, overseeing selection of metric tools to measure the impact of ILSI's scientific outputs, and exploring other publishing opportunities.

VII. Report of the Financial Oversight Committee

Dr. Liz Westring, ILSI Treasurer and Chair of the ILSI Board of Trustees Financial Oversight Committee, began her report by thanking the members of the committee – Dr. Abraham, Dr. Chang, Dr. Gerhard Eisenbrand, Dr. Joanne Lupton, Mr. Rodriguez, and Dr. Lewis Smith. She also thanked Ms. Beth-Ellen Berry, ILSI Chief Financial Officer, for her excellent work throughout the year. The committee's report and ILSI financial statements were distributed to the trustees electronically prior to the meeting and were included in the trustee briefing book. The financial statements were the balance sheet as of November 30, 2014 and the functional activity statement with 2014 year-end projections and 2015 proposed budget. Also included in the briefing books was a document titled, "How to Read Your ILSI Financial Statements."

Beginning with the balance sheet, which shows assets, liabilities and net assets on November 30, 2014, Dr. Westring noted that the final balances for the year were not provided. However, the November 30, 2014 balances provide a reasonable indication of ILSI's financial health. The year-end balances will be prepared and will be audited in early 2015. The November 30, 2014 balances show that ILSI is maintaining sufficient liquidity and has healthy assets in both the ILSI unrestricted and restricted activities.

ILSI has a Board-designated reserve fund which was officially established in 2013, with a target balance of 50 percent of the annual unrestricted budget (~\$600,000). The investment policy for this reserve fund was revised by the Financial Oversight Committee in the fourth quarter of 2014. Going forward the asset allocation will change from being 100 percent invested in fixed income instruments to 40 percent equity and 60 percent fixed income. While this change to a more diversified portfolio will increase opportunities for long-term growth, it will also mean that month-to-month volatility is more likely. The Board-designated reserve fund is invested in broad market index funds with low fees. On December 31, 2014, the balance was \$576,229 with earnings of 1.7 percent for the year.

Moving to the revenue and expenses (income statement) by functional area, Dr. Westring first focused on the unrestricted activities of ILSI Governance and Coordination (GC), Communications and Press. ILSI GC covers the international network of branches, the ILSI Board of Trustees, and ILSI's portion of the annual meeting. Communications covers proactive outreach, the ILSI website and the branch extranet. ILSI Press covers *Nutrition Reviews*, ILSI's monthly scientific journal, and *Present Knowledge in Nutrition, 10th edition*. Looking at the subtotal for the ILSI unrestricted functions, Dr. Westring noted that revenue in 2014 exceeded budget by 9 percent, primarily due to the \$100,000 signing bonus from Oxford University Press, the new publisher for *Nutrition Reviews*, beginning in 2015. In response to a question about advertising revenue, Ms. Berry said that banner ads are being run in the online journal. Such revenue is included in the publishing agreement with Oxford University Press.

Expenses exceeded budget by 7 percent due to two unbudgeted grants for One ILSI projects, one to ILSI Health and Environmental Sciences Institute (HESI) and the other to ILSI Southeast Asia Region. Funds were raised in 2013 to provide support for the One ILSI projects in the thematic areas, although the particular projects and necessary funding were not mapped out at the time the 2014 budget was developed. ILSI is projected to end 2014 with net assets of \$1,078,256, which will be a decline in net assets of \$2,901 from the beginning of 2014.

In comparing 2014 projections to the 2015 proposed budget, Dr. Westring noted that ILSI had been sharing an executive director with the ILSI Research Foundation and received reimbursement for the foundation's share of salary/benefit expenses. This is shown in the "fee for service" line under revenue. In 2015, Dr. Harris will move to 60 percent effort for ILSI only and the foundation will employ its own full-time executive director. Thus, both salary/benefit expenses and "fee for service" revenue will be reduced in 2015 by approximately \$95,000. Small increases for operating costs have been included in the 2015 budget and the annual meeting expenses have been increased to account for a more expensive venue, compared to 2014. The proposed 2015 budget shows year end net assets of \$1,103,893 compared to \$1,078,256 at the projected 2014 year-end net assets.

Turning to the restricted functions, which include functions mandated by branch leadership, steering committees, or outside donors, Dr. Westring reminded the ILSI Board of Trustees that these funds are not available to fund unrestricted activities and these accounts must maintain positive net assets. The current restricted functions are:

- Platform for International Partnerships (PIP) -- manages ILSI's interactions with WHO and FAO
- Global Travel Fund – supports branch staff travel to other branches
- Developing Food and Water Safety Capacity in Sub-Saharan Africa and Asia – supports training and internship programs in developing countries
- Malaspina Travel Award – supports outreach to young scientists
- International Branch Activity – supports local activities for ILSI Focal Point in China and Latin American branches coordination
- Shared Services – support human resources, accounting, legal, and information technology for the ILSI corporations based in Washington, DC, USA.

The revenue from contributions in 2014 exceeded the budget by 25 percent. In addition to annual contributions from ILSI member companies, PIP received a one-time contribution from the Industry Council for Development (ICD). The Coca-Cola Company contributed \$325,000 for 2014 and \$350,000 for 2015 to fund PIP activities, food and water safety programs, the Malaspina International Scholar Travel Award, and a coordination position to strengthen the ILSI branch network in Latin America. Plans for the restricted programs were not developed at the time that the 2014 budget was prepared, thus expenses exceed what was included in the budget by 13 percent. The projected 2014 year-end net assets for the restricted functions are \$857,355 compared to the budget value of \$539,225.

Comparing the projected 2014 year-end restricted functions to the proposed 2015 budget, Dr. Westring noted that revenue from contributions is down by 22 percent, though substantial contributions made in 2014 were for 2015 activities. Annual contributions from ILSI member companies for PIP and the Sub-Saharan Africa program are expected to continue. Expenses are budgeted to be down by four percent, as program plans are still being developed for some of the 2015 restricted activities. The proposed 2015

budget shows net assets at the end of the year of \$769,003, compared to the projected 2014 year-end net assets of \$857,355.

Summarizing the total ILSI functional activity statement, the 2014 projected year-end net assets are \$1,935,610, compared to the year-end net assets for the 2014 budget, which were \$1,585,236. The proposed 2015 budget shows total year-end net assets of \$1,872,897.

VIII. Adoption of the ILSI Budget

Action: Dr. Westring moved that the 2015 ILSI budget be approved as presented to the board. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

IX. Report from the ILSI Research Foundation

Dr. Adam Drewnowski, Chair, ILSI Research Foundation Board of Trustees, began his report by thanking the members of the ILSI Research Foundation Executive Director Search Committee, several of whom are ILSI Trustees. He also congratulated Dr. Morven McLean, who accepted the offer to become the first full-time executive director for the foundation.

A written report of the foundation's accomplishments in 2014 was included in the trustees' briefing book. Dr. Drewnowski described the ILSI Research Foundation as an international entity that works both independently and in concert with other ILSI entities, to advance the mission of ILSI. In 2014, the foundation had four centers of excellence – Center for Environmental Risk Assessment (CERA), Center for Risk Science Innovation and Application (RSIA), Center for Safety Assessment of Food and Feed (CSAFF), and the Center for Integrated Modeling of Sustainable Agriculture and Nutrition Security (CIMSANS). There was also a program on nutrition and health.

To date, CERA has focused largely on applied research, related to improving how genetically-modified crops are evaluated for potential adverse environmental impacts. Developing environmental risk assessment tools for low exposure scenarios continues to be an important topic for CERA as the disproportionate focus on hazard assessment has led to trade disruptions as well as limitations on research and development. The so-called "low-level presence" occurs when small amounts of genetically-modified grain that has been commercially approved in the country of export is subsequently discovered in shipments to countries of import where approval for the specific grain is absent or pending.

CERA also works collaboratively with multiple public and private sector organizations to improve and standardize the risk assessment methods applied to evaluating the potential environmental impacts that a transgenic protein may have on non-target organisms. This work has been translated into hands-on field and lab training programs, with attendees from many of the developing countries where CERA is active. CERA developed a conceptual framework that provides a scientifically defensible process for evaluating if existing data from experimental field trials are relevant and/or sufficient for environmental risk assessments conducted in other countries. Additionally, it promotes a strategic approach to identifying field trial site locations, so that field data will be transportable from one regulatory jurisdiction to another.

Capacity building is a key function for CERA, making sure that the good science being done at ILSI and elsewhere is accessible to the people who need it to support their work. The Partnership Project in

Biosafety Risk Assessment & Regulation, which ended in 2014, was active in eight countries (Bangladesh, Colombia, Kenya, Paraguay, Tanzania, Uruguay, Uganda, and Vietnam). Having met all of its milestones, the project is now undergoing an external assessment as part of the funding agreement with the World Bank.

CSAFF promotes science-based approaches to the safety assessment of food and feed, with a strong emphasis on improved knowledge dissemination and capacity building. A tripartite scientific advisory council is being established to provide scientific guidance to the center, in line with the councils that have been put together for CERA and CIMSANS.

CSAFF also maintains the ILSI Crop Composition Database, a valuable tool for comparative food safety assessment. The most recent update (Version 5.0) contains over 800,000 data points for comparative assessment, covering 3150 compositional components for six crops, including newly added canola, sweet corn and rice.

In 2014, CSAFF organized a tripartite, multi-stage capacity building program on toxicity testing relevant to safety assessment of genetically modified foods. This work was supported by a grant from the U. S. Agency for International Development and with materials donated by DuPont Pioneer. The first phase of the training, in New Delhi, India, included classroom lectures and practical exercises for food safety training. The second phase, which took place at the Stine Haskell Research Facility in Newark, Delaware, USA, involved actual laboratory experience related to toxicity testing.

The primary mission of CIMSANS is to foster new public-private partnerships on integrated modeling that improve both scientific understanding and public policy around the growing impacts of climate change and resource scarcity – especially water – on sustainable nutrition security (SNS). Through a series of peer-reviewed publications, the center has already helped release private-sector maize breeding trial data as Open Data and has produced improved assessment methodologies for maize and other major row crops. As with other ILSI entities, CIMSANS has quickly become an important global partner, engaging hundreds of influential scientists among dozens of key organizations within academia, governments, and the private sector. CIMSANS has co-hosted a series of conferences with increasing levels of global impact. CIMSANS is now gathering the partners and resources needed to produce the first credible, comprehensive, global SNS assessment that includes all of the world's most important staple and non-staple foods.

Active partnerships include GEOSHARE and SUSFANS, which also includes ILSI Europe. CIMSANS is partnering with several public and private sector organizations to finalize the metrics that will be included in the sustainable nutrition security assessment. A workshop is scheduled for February 17, Washington to “co-create” with a broad set of stakeholders, including the International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI), mathematical expressions for the nutrition metrics. These expressions will then be added to the available integrated models. A paper describing the finalized SNS metrics will be published in the peer-reviewed scientific literature.

RSIA was active with two major topics in 2014. The center provided a grant to the Harvard Center for Risk Analysis to support a conference and development of a series of case studies on risk of risk perception. After publishing a series of papers on how to go about measuring the release of nanomaterial in various products, RSIA handed off the standard methods development to the U.S. National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health and the National Institute of Standards and Technology. RSIA ceased operation at the end of 2014.

Dr. Drewnowski reported that 59 percent of the foundation's funding came from the public sector in 2014, with 36 percent from the private sector, 2 percent from foundations, 2 percent from other ILSI entities and 1 percent from nongovernmental organizations. The foundation actively collaborated with nine ILSI branches in 2014 – Argentina, Brasil, Europe, India, Korea, North America, North Andean, South Andean, and Southeast Asia Region. He also called attention to the foundation's output during the past year – 35 conferences, meetings and workshops and 18 peer-reviewed publications.

Going forward, Dr. Drewnowski described the focus of the Research Foundation as agriculture, food safety, sustainability and nutrition security. In his view, health and non-communicable disease prevention easily fit within these topics. In the future, he suggested that there would be more emphasis on understanding dietary intake, both from the risk assessment and the nutrition perspectives.

Dr. Knowles pointed out that the Horizon 2020 program in Europe is actively seeking to increase international partnerships, particularly with the United States, BRIC countries, Africa and Latin America. He encouraged the foundation to utilize this interest to their advantage.

In response to trustee questions about why RSIA activities were terminated and what would be done with the remaining funds, Dr. Harris said that she made the decision to close RSIA because the center was not able to fund its programs. The ILSI Research Foundation Board of Trustees set a policy of maintaining positive net assets for all centers. RSIA had not been able to meet this criterion for several years and plans for 2015 did not show that meeting the criterion would be feasible. Any remaining funding commitments made by RSIA will be honored.

X. Report from the ILSI Platform for International Partnerships

A written report on the 2014 activities of the ILSI Platform for International Partnerships (PIP) was included in the trustee briefing book.

Dr. Harris asked the ILSI Board of Trustees to consider an amendment to the membership section of the ILSI bylaws as a way of addressing a concern recently raised by the World Health Organization (WHO). ILSI's status as a recognized nongovernmental organization is up for renewal as part of an ongoing three-year cycle used by WHO. ILSI provided the requested information about its performance under the 2012-2014 WHO/ILSI Plan of Work and developed a new three-year plan of work with various parts of WHO. These materials were all submitted on time. In late December, Dr. Harris received an email request to update an informational database which included a question about whether ILSI had members that were involved with tobacco. ILSI answered the question accurately, saying that one member – ITC Food Businesses – was part of a conglomerate that included a tobacco company. ITC actually stands for Indian Tobacco Company. This company has been a member of ILSI-India for many years and ILSI has repeatedly acknowledge them as a member and told WHO that ILSI-India and ILSI were not in any way involved with tobacco.

About one week prior to the ILSI Annual Meeting, Dr. Harris learned that the WHO Secretariat's report on the "Review of nongovernmental organizations in official relations with WHO" (EB136/NGO/WP/1) specifically called attention to the fact that "a member company of one of its branches is owned by a company that manufactures and sells tobacco products." The secretariat report goes on to recommend that ILSI's status be renewed. In talking with the ILSI assigned technical officer at WHO, Dr. Harris was encouraged to take action to resolve the problem – membership by a tobacco-associated company.

Hence, with help from Mr. Shawn Sullivan, ILSI Legal Counsel, and others, an amendment to the bylaws (attached) was drafted and was distributed to the ILSI Board of Trustees for consideration.

During the discussion that followed several trustees expressed frustration that this member was being singled-out unfairly as the member was not involved in tobacco production, manufacturing, marketing or sales. Others noted that this is a serious issue. Dr. Boobis said that as an academic working at a United Kingdom university, he is required to annually certify that he is not involved with any organization associated with tobacco. Failure to do so would limit his ability to receive government funding. Dr. Peter van Bladeren said that if ILSI were to be publicly linked with tobacco, his company, Nestlé, would seriously consider dropping out of the organization. Others suggested that ILSI should carefully monitor its relations with WHO.

Action: A motion was made to amend Article II: Membership of the ILSI bylaws to add the proposed two final sentences. The motion was seconded and passed by a hand vote of 28 in favor and one abstention.

Dr. Harris thanked the Board for their swift and decisive action and said that she would report this action to WHO immediately. She then turned to a second, and perhaps more difficult issue, of how ILSI may be categorized by WHO in the draft non-State actors framework. The draft being considered by the WHO Executive Board has four categories – nongovernmental organizations, private sector entities, philanthropic foundations and academic institutions. ILSI categorized itself as a scientific/academic entity in an online questionnaire distributed by WHO. The WHO Secretariat states in their “Review of nongovernmental organizations in official relations with WHO” (EB136/NGO/WP/1; para 7) that ILSI should be listed as a private sector entity. Such a categorization by WHO is unacceptable to ILSI, because ILSI is incorporated as a public charity. Should WHO insist on calling ILSI a private sector entity, ILSI may have to end all activities with WHO to avoid such a classification. ILSI is preparing a letter to WHO explaining its concerns and asking for a meeting at which to discuss them.

Before moving on to the next agenda item, Dr. Cohen called attention to the new Malaspina International Scholar Travel Award. Ten such awards were given this first year and nine of the ten awardees have come to the 2015 ILSI Annual Meeting. These scholars were nominated by the branches in the region where the scholar lives and the final list of awardees was chosen by a selection committee composed of mostly ILSI trustees. The scholars are at a mid-level point in their careers and will hopefully gain a good appreciation of ILSI from the annual meeting experience. Dr. Cohen acknowledged The Coca-Cola Company for supporting this award. He also encouraged all trustees to meet the awardees. They will be recognized during the ILSI Assembly of Members meeting on Sunday, January 18, 2015.

XI. Report of the ILSI Nomination Review Committee

Dr. Takeshi Kimura, Chair, ILSI Nomination Review Committee, began his report by thanking the members of the committee – Dr. Cohen, Dr. Knowles, Dr. Weaver, and Dr. Flávio Zambrone – for their assistance with the committee’s tasks. The committee’s report was included in the trustees briefing book.

The first of the three tasks given to the ILSI Nomination Review Committee was to review the nominees for seats on the ILSI Board of Trustees. Three trustees will retire from the board – Mr. Felipe Rodriguez, Dr. P.K. Seth, and Dr. Geoff Thompson (resigned mid-year). Dr. Kimura asked the board members to acknowledge the service of these three trustees with a round of applause.

The following individuals were re-nominated by the branches in the respective regions for additional three-year terms on the ILSI Board of Trustees:

Asia-Pacific North	Dr. Takeshi Kimura (I)
Europe/Africa	Dr. John O'Brien (I) Dr. Peter van Bladeren (I)
HESI	Dr. Alan Boobis (P) Dr. Lewis Smith (P)
Latin America	Dr. Flávio Zambrone (P)
North America	Dr. Todd Abraham (I) Dr. Michael Doyle (P) Dr. Catherine Field (P) Dr. Joanne Lupton (P)
Research Foundation	Dr. Adam Drewnowski (P)

New Nominees offered by the branches are:

Asia Pacific South	Dr. B. Sesikeran (P)
Europe/Africa	Dr. Peter Weber (I)
Latin America	Mr. Ary Bucione (I)

Bios for the new nominees were included in the trustee briefing book. Dr. Kimura reminded the trustees that in January 2013, the ILSI Board of Trustees elected Dr. Applebaum as the ILSI Vice-President. She was added to the ILSI Board of Trustees in a special 32nd seat as allowed under the bylaws (Article IV, Section 1). But this special seat is only valid for a year at a time, so it is necessary to re-elect her for this year.

The ILSI Nomination Review Committee approved all of these nominations and Dr. Kimura will present these names to the ILSI Assembly of members meeting on Sunday, January 18, 2015, for election.

To allow Dr. Applebaum to remain on the ILSI Board, Dr. Kimura asked that the ILSI Board approve the expansion of the Board by one seat, as allowed by the bylaws. The number of public sector trustees will still exceed the number of private sector trustees with Dr. Applebaum's election to this additional seat.

Action: Dr. Kimura moved that the ILSI Board of Trustees be expanded by one seat to 32 seats to allow Dr. Rhona Applebaum to remain a member of the ILSI Board of Trustees. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

The second task for the ILSI Nomination Review Committee was to nominate officers of the board and at-large members of the ILSI Executive Committee. Officers serve two-year terms; at-large members are elected annually. The succession plan adopted several years ago calls for the Vice President and Vice Chair to move up to the positions of President and Chair, if acceptable. The Nomination Review Committee agreed that the current Vice President, Rhona Applebaum, should become the ILSI President. The committee also agreed to nominate Dr. Peter van Bladeren as the new Vice President. If elected both are willing to serve.

In January 2014, Dr. Alan Boobis agreed to move into the Chair role in January 2015, assuming the next Nomination Review Committee agreed. Dr. Kimura reported that the committee did agree. The committee also agreed to nominate Dr. Connie Weaver as the ILSI Vice Chair for one year. Both Dr. Boobis and Dr. Weaver are being proposed for one-year terms to return to the regular rotation cycle in January 2016. Both may be re-elected at that time for full two-year terms as Chair and Vice Chair, respectively. Both were willing to serve.

The committee nominated Dr. Flavio Zambrone for a two-year term as Secretary. Dr. Zambrone was willing to serve, if elected. The committee nominated Dr. Marion Ehrich, Dr. Tamotsu Kuwata, Mr. Geoff Smith and Dr. Peter Weber for one-year terms as At-Large Members of the ILSI Executive Committee. All agreed to serve, if elected.

Action: Dr. Kimura moved the election of Dr. Applebaum as President, Dr. van Bladeren as Vice President, Dr. Boobis as Chair for one year, Dr. Weaver for Vice Chair for one year, Dr. Zambrone for Secretary, and Drs. Ehrich, Weber, and Kuwata and Mr. Geoff Smith as At-Large Members, with the understanding that Dr. Applebaum and Dr. Weber would be elected to the Board by the Assembly of Members on Sunday, January 18, 2015. The motion was seconded and carried unanimously.

The third and final task of the ILSI Nomination Review Committee was to nominate candidates for three-year terms on the ILSI Research Foundation Board of Trustees. Nominees submitted by the ILSI Research Foundation Nominating Committee were reviewed by the ILSI Nomination Review Committee and approved. The nominees were Dr. Jerry Hjelle (renomination), Dr. Ronald Kleinman, and Dr. Ivonne Rietjens. Bios for Drs. Kleinman and Rietjens were included in the trustee briefing book. Dr. Applebaum, as ILSI President, has an assigned seat on the ILSI Research Foundation Board of Trustees.

Action: Dr. Kimura moved the election of Drs. Hjelle, Kleinman and Rietjens each for a three-year term on the ILSI Research Foundation Board of Trustees. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Dr. Kimura also recognized the ILSI Research Foundation trustees whose terms expired at the end of the 2015 ILSI Annual Meeting -- Dr. Dennis Bier, Dr. Jim Bus, and Dr. John Peters.

XII. Comments from the ILSI President and ILSI Board Chair

Dr. Applebaum thanked the ILSI Board of Trustees for their support, saying that she was honored to serve as president for ILSI, an organization about which she was passionate. She said that she would operate with an “open-door” policy and encouraged trustees to contact her with questions, comments or concerns at any time. She described her belief in the strength of “threes”, such as ILSI’s tripartite nature. She likes to use scorecards to follow complex and competitive tasks. Though she admitted that she would not be able to fill Dr. Hjelle’s shoes, she will focus on collaboration, value and communication as the three areas she will strengthen during her two-year tenure as the ILSI President.

Dr. Boobis also thanked the ILSI Board of Trustees for their support. He noted that leading ILSI presents a substantial challenge. The organization is dynamic and not afraid to ask itself tough questions. ILSI carries out substantial work with very small resources. He noted that ILSI needs to think carefully about the challenges it faces, as the organization is still under attack. Dr. Boobis also complimented Dr. Cohen on his outstanding service to ILSI as the chair for the past three years. He described Dr. Cohen as a leader who makes ILSI an organization worth being involved with. Dr. Cohen is also a strong leader who executes with kindness and tact. He presented Dr. Cohen with a gift.

In turning over the chairmanship of the ILSI Board of Trustees to Dr. Boobis, Dr. Cohen stated that he greatly enjoyed serving as the board chair and noted that working with ILSI has given him the opportunity to work with the “most phenomenal people in the world.”

XIII. Other Business

- a. New Branch Proposals** – Dr. Knowles, Chair of the ILSI Branch Development Committee, briefly described the application for branch status from the study group in the Middle East. The ILSI Branch Development Committee reviewed the application in detail during their meeting on Friday evening, January 16. The committee members present (Mike Knowles, P.K. Seth, and Geoff Smith) agreed that the study group had satisfied the eight criteria for forming a new branch. While the proposed branch constitution still needs some editorial revisions, the committee recommended that the new branch, ILSI Middle East, as described in the written motion distributed at the meeting (attached), be approved.

Action: Dr. Knowles moved adoption of the motion. There was a second and the motion carried unanimously.

Dr. Knowles also reminded the board that the former branch, ILSI North Africa and Gulf Region, had been closed. There is some interest in North African countries like Morocco, especially among academics to develop ILSI-led collaborations. He will monitor this situation and report back to the ILSI Board of Trustees.

ILSI South Africa is still interested in expanding to cover more of Sub-Saharan Africa and they may establish a study group to explore which countries and the timetable for such expansion. Dr. Knowles said there was substantial external interest in such an expansion.

- b. Proposal from ILSI Japan Center for Health Promotion** – Mr. Takashi Togami, Director, ILSI Japan Center for Health Promotion (CHP), was invited by the chair to make a presentation about the center’s work to the ILSI Board of Trustees. Mr. Togami’s presentation was distributed to the trustees prior to the meeting.

Mr. Togami reviewed the significant outcomes from three programs managed by his center – Project IDEA, Project SWAN and Project PAN, all of which are contributing to improving public health in one or more Asian countries. To date ILSI Japan CHP has been supported by strong links with respected academic and administrative networks in these countries. ILSI Southeast Asia has been an important collaborator for ILSI Japan CHP. Other opportunities have been suggested especially in Africa. However, ILSI Japan CHP is facing a critical shortage of resources – funds and professional manpower. The annual budget of ILSI Japan CHP has been in the range of \$300,000 – 500,000 in recent years. This funding has come from members of ILSI Japan and public funds from the government of Japan. Mr. Togami said that the programs now need a broader funding base.

Over the past 15 years, ILSI Japan CHP showed that ILSI could contribute to and improve the public health and directly benefit at-risk populations. Especially, ILSI Japan CHP has

shown that ILSI's tripartite partnership can effectively work to solve public health problems based on scientific evidence. Mr. Togami asked the ILSI Board of Trustees to study whether ILSI organizations can initiate and participate in social programs and how ILSI fundraising, financial operation, and collaboration with international organizations could contribute.

Several trustees suggested possible partners for ILSI Japan CHP, including the International Water Association (IWA) for Project SWAN and the International Finance Corporation (IFC) at the World Bank.

Dr. Boobis suggested that Dr. van Bladeren lead a study group with the following members – Dr. Hjelle, Mr. Geoff Smith and Mr. Togami – to review the information provided by Mr. Togami and report back to the ILSI Board of Trustees.

c. Plans for 2016, 2017, and 2018 ILSI Annual Meetings

Dr. Harris referred the trustees to the flyer at the back of the trustees briefing book for the dates and venues for these three meetings:

22-26 January 2016 – Renaissance Vinoy Resort & Golf Club, St. Petersburg , FL, USA

20-25 January 2017 – Hilton La Jolla Torrey Pines, LaJolla, CA, USA

19-24 January 2018 – Fairmont Southampton, Southampton, Bermuda

Mr. Geoff Smith suggested that staff investigate having the ILSI Annual Meeting outside of the United States.

XIV. Adjournment

As there was not further business, Dr. Boobis thanked the trustees for their active participation and adjourned the meeting at noon.

Signed: _____ Date: _____