

1 Michael J. Miller (appearance *pro hac vice*)
2 Timothy Litzenburg (appearance *pro hac vice*)
3 Curtis G. Hoke (State Bar No. 282465)
4 **The Miller Firm, LLC**
5 108 Railroad Ave.
6 Orange, VA 22960
7 (540) 672-4224 phone; (540) 672-3055 fax
8 mmiller@millerfirmllc.com
9 tlitzenburg@millerfirmllc.com
10 choke@millerfirmllc.com

11 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*
12 **DEWAYNE JOHNSON**

ELECTRONICALLY
FILED
*Superior Court of California,
County of San Francisco*
06/12/2018
Clerk of the Court
BY: VANESSA WU
Deputy Clerk

13 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**
14 **FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

15 DEWAYNE JOHNSON,

16 Plaintiff,

17 v.

18 MONSANTO COMPANY ET AL.,

19 Defendants.

Case No. CGC-16-550128

**PLAINTIFF'S REPLY IN SUPPORT OF
PLAINTIFF'S MOTION *IN LIMINE* NO. 9
TO EXCLUDE EVIDENCE OF EXPERT'S
FINANCES AND PERSONAL ASSETS
THAT ARE UNRELATED TO LITIGATION
INVOLVING GLYPHOSATE-
CONTAINING HERBICIDES AND NON-
HODGKIN'S LYMPHOMA**

Trial Judge: TBD

Trial Date: June 18, 2018

Time: 9:30 a.m.

Department: TBD

1 **I. ARGUMENT**

2 The Defendant has not shown via their Opposition why specific information as to the expert’s
3 yearly total income or unrelated case specific information is relevant and thus such information should
4 be excluded.

5 Although the Defendant may be allowed to discover what percentage of the expert’s practice
6 involved plaintiff and defense medical examinations and a numerical estimate of the compensation the
7 expert in question received from that work, the Defendant is not entitled to learn the precise details of
8 the expert’s billing and accounting records or exact dollar amounts for the purpose of showing bias.
9 *Allen v. Superior Court*, supra, 151 Cal.App.3d at p. 453, 198 Cal.Rptr. 737.

10 The Defendant cites *Stony Brook I Homeowners Ass'n v. Superior Court*, 84 Cal. App. 4th 691,
11 in an attempt to bolster their argument but their reliance on the case is misplaced in that *Stony Brook*
12 followed the *Allen* standard of percentages and not requiring “exact information” about specific income
13 totals. (“Although an expert must provide such information about his role in prior proceedings as will
14 permit an adversary a meaningful opportunity to demonstrate any bias or prejudice, precise information
15 about the number of cases in which the expert has testified or the amount of compensation the expert has
16 received is not required.”) *Id.* at 693.

17 While *Stony Brook* may support discovery into numerical estimates of defense and plaintiff-
18 related work and a numerical estimate of the amount of income generated from that defense and
19 plaintiff-related litigation, it does not permit unfettered access to an expert’s potential bias. *Id.* at 699.

20 Thus, the Defendant should be limited to evidence of numerical estimates on the amount of
21 income Plaintiff’s expert has generated from defense and plaintiff-related litigation. Plaintiff should not
22 have to give a detailed break down of exact dollar amounts or case specific information for each
23 litigation that he has worked on which is unrelated to the matter at hand.

24
25 **II. CONCLUSION**

26 Based on the foregoing, Plaintiff Dewayne Johnson respectfully requests that the Court enter an
27 Order granting Plaintiff’s Motion *in Limine* No. 9.

1 DATED: June 12, 2018

Respectfully submitted,

2 **THE MILLER FIRM, LLC**

3
4 By: 

5 Curtis G. Hoke (SBN 282465)
6 Timothy Litzenburg (appearance *pro hac vice*)
7 Michael J. Miller (appearance *pro hac vice*)
8 **THE MILLER FIRM, LLC**
9 108 Railroad Ave.
10 Orange, VA 22960
11 (540) 672-4224 phone
12 (540) 672-3055 fax
13 tlitzenburg@millerfirmllc.com
14 choke@millerfirmllc.com

15 *Attorneys for Plaintiff,*
16 *DEWAYNE JOHNSON*

1 PROOF OF SERVICE

2 I, Curtis G. Hoke, declare as follows:

3 I am a citizen of the United States and am employed in Orange County, Virginia. I am over the
4 age of eighteen years and not a party to the within action. My business address is 108 Railroad
5 Avenue, Orange, Virginia 22960. On June 12, 2018 _____, I served the following
documents by the method indicated below:

6 PLAINTIFF'S REPLY IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFF'S MOTION IN LIMINE NO. 9 TO
7 EXCLUDE EVIDENCE OF EXPERT'S FINANCES AND PERSONAL ASSETS THAT
8 ARE UNRELATED TO LITIGATION INVOLVING GLYPHOSATE-CONTAINING
HERBICIDES AND NON-HODGKIN'S LYMPHOMA

9
10
11
12
13
14
15 By Electronically Serving the document(s) described above via LexisNexis File & Serve
16 by 7:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time on all parties appearing on the LexisNexis File & Serve
service list.

17 **SEE ATTACHED SERVICE LIST**

18
19 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above
is true and correct.

20
21 Executed on this June 12, 2018 at Orange, Virginia.

22 

23
24 Curtis G. Hoke,
25 Declarant

1 *Johnson v. Monsanto Company, et al.*
2 **San Francisco Superior Court Case No.: CGC-16-550128**

3 **SERVICE LIST**

| | |
|---|---|
| 4 George C. Lombardi, Esq. 5 James M. Hilmert, Esq. 6 WINSTON & STRAWN LLP 7 35 West Wacker Drive 8 Chicago, IL 60601 9 Tel: (312) 558-5969 10 Fax: (312) 558-5700 11 glombard@winston.com 12 jhilmert@winston.com | Counsel for Defendant Served electronically Via Lexis Nexis File&Serve Xpress |
| 13 Joe G. Hollingsworth, Esq. 14 Eric G. Lasker, Esq. 15 Martin C. Calhoun, Esq. 16 Kirby T. Griffis, Esq. 17 William J. Cople III, Esq. 18 HOLLINGSWORTH LLP 19 1350 I Street, N.W. 20 Washington, DC 20005 21 Tel: (202) 898-5800 22 Fax: (202) 682-1639 23 jhollingsworth@hollingsworthllp.com 24 elasker@hollingsworthllp.com 25 mcalhoun@hollingsworthllp.com 26 kgriffis@hollingsworthllp.com 27 wcople@hollingsworthllp.com | Counsel for Defendant Served electronically via Lexis Nexis File&Serve Xpress |
| 28 Sandra A. Edwards, Esq. Joshua W. Malone, Esq. Farella Braun + Martel LLP 235 Montgomery Street, 17 th Floor San Francisco, California 94104 Tel: (415) 95404400 Fax: (415) 954-4480 sedwards@fbm.com jmalone@fbm.com | Counsel for Defendant Served electronically via Lexis Nexis File&Serve Xpress |

28 PROOF OF SERVICE